

24.10.2022

**Tender Number 10/2022 to be carried out through an international consultant,
an analysis of the existing competitive procedures in public transport in Israel and abroad –
Clarifications and the Ministry's response to clarification questions**

Below are the additional clarifications and answers of the Ministry of Transport and Road Safety (hereinafter: "the Ministry") regarding Tender Number 10/2022 to be carried out through an international consultant, an analysis of the existing competitive procedures in public transport in Israel and abroad (hereinafter: "the Tender") as well as to the clarifications published on 22.9.2022 and the clarification questions sent in writing by the bidders until the deadline set for 06.10.2022 at 16:00.

1. All clarifications, changes and amendments mentioned in this document shall be considered as if they were included in the Tender documents from the beginning, they will bind the bidders and will be considered an integral part of the Tender and the contractual agreement, unless otherwise stated.
2. All terms and expression mentioned in this document will have the same interpretation as stated in the Tender documents.
3. Do not rely on any explanation or interpretation given orally or in writing or in any other way by someone on behalf of the Ministry or the Tender Committee, insofar as possible, in any forum or form. The only changes from what is stated in the Tender documents as well as all the interpretations and clarifications thereof, are as detailed in this document only and in additional clarification documents that will be published on behalf of the Tenders Committee in writing, insofar as they are published.
4. What is stated in this document does not change or detract from what is stated in the Tender documents, unless explicitly stated otherwise.
5. In any case of contradiction between the instructions of this clarification document and the Tender documents, the clarification document shall prevail.

No.	Chapter / Appendix	Section	Question	Approved answer
1	Chapter A + Chapter C Answers clarification questions	Section 4, Section 7 Section 7.2 - Components 1 and 2 of the Standards. Section 7.3. + Clarification answers No. 1	<p>Further to the answer to question 1 in the clarification answers document - It was clarified that for the purpose of the threshold conditions, it is possible to propose a candidate who has either experience in accompanying tenders or experience in publishing application studies.</p> <p>Our sincere apologies to the Committee as we wish to bring to its attention, what may constitute a hidden threshold condition in the Tender documents and request to change the standards accordingly: According to the standards in section 7.3, you must score at least 42 points out of the 60 quality points. A simple calculation reveals that it is not possible to accumulate 42 points without presenting at least one tender support project (from component 1 of the standards - "number of countries/authorities with whom..." - since in the rest of the components, you can earn up to 36 points. In other words, accompanying the requested international tenders is actually a hidden threshold condition.</p> <p>Moreover, it is recorded in this component that the experience that will be scored is "beyond" what was presented in the threshold conditions - In other words, the bidder may be required to present 3 projects as mentioned in order to start accumulating a quality score in this component.</p> <p>In addition, in relation to component 2 of the standards ("Financial scope of tenders..") - It is not possible to accumulate points without the threshold experience accompanying tenders.</p> <p>In light of the above, we hereby request the Tenders Committee to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Reduce the quality threshold to 20 points, so that it is coherent with the threshold condition. Alternatively, change the scoring weights, so that a minimum quality score can be accumulated coherently with the threshold conditions. B. In addition, delete in component 1 of the standards the words "Beyond those submitted as proof of the threshold conditions." <p>In addition, delete the words in component 2 of the standards "Beyond those submitted as proof of the threshold conditions."</p>	There is no change in the Tender documents.

No.	Chapter / Appendix	Section	Question	Approved answer
2	Chapter C Answers clarification questions	Section 7.2 – Component 3 of the Standards. + Clarification answer No. 2	Further to the answer to question 1 in the clarification answers document - It was clarified that there is no need for peer review in applied research. For the same reason, we ask the Tenders Committee to clarify that a score will be given for applied research published at an international level, such as journals, conferences, etc., even without peer review, which, as mentioned, is not acceptable in the field of applied research.	Section 7.2, component 3 in scoring will be amended to: "5 points for each applied research in the field of public transport bus tenders, for local, metropolitan or governmental authorities."
3	Chapter C	Section 7.2 – Components 1 and 2	In addition to the questions above, please confirm that for the purpose of scoring the standards, an international consultant who meets the threshold conditions will also be able to provide the experience of his staff or of the organization on whose behalf he is acting, within the proposal.	There is no change in the Tender documents.
4	Chapter C + Answers clarification questions	Section 7.2	Further to the answer to question 12 and 13 for the clarification answers, it was clarified that only bus service lines will be scored for the purpose of the standards. Please make it clear that even consulting and accompanying the tender of service taxi lines in Israel will be taken into account for the purpose of component 4 of the standards (the experience of the Israeli consultant).	There is no change in the Tender documents.
5	Chapter C	Section 7.2	The Israeli accompanying consultant - Please confirm that relevant experience in the field of public transport planning will also be considered for the purpose of granting the score as stated in the section.	There is no change in the Tender documents.

No.	Chapter / Appendix	Section	Question	Approved answer
6	Chapter C	Section 7.2	<p>It is clear from the Tender requirements, that the Ministry strives for practical and relevant recommendations that can be implemented. Therefore, the Israeli accompanying consultant is actually required to accompany the project and the international consultant as far as the Israeli market is concerned in terms of breadth and regulatory characteristics relevant to the public transport market. In addition, the consultant is required to be familiar with procedures, sources and optimal work practices relevant to policy for the public service in Israel (without necessary dependence on public transport).</p> <p>Accordingly, we ask that you give an equivalent quality score to the consultant, who:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Has experience in applied policy and regulatory studies in Israel - In the areas of transport, public transport as well as in other areas. B. Has experience in applied policy work for the analysis of monopsony markets for the provision of public services - Similar to the state of affairs in the public transport market. <p>In addition, the Israeli consultant is actually required to be proficient in tender procedures in Israel, which have unique characteristics in terms of the Tenders Law, its regulations, instructions and rulings. Proficiency in this work is relevant to all fields and not necessarily to tenders in the field of public transport and providing a quality score for this experience will allow the Ministry to enjoy the benefits inherent in knowledge, extensive experience and methods used in other Ministries.</p> <p>Accordingly, we ask that you provide a quality score which is at least equivalent to a consultant who has experience in the field of tenders in Israel - writing, editing, planning competition mechanisms within public service tenders (government, authorities), even in areas other than public transport.</p>	<p>There is no change in the Tender documents.</p>

No.	Chapter / Appendix	Section	Question	Approved answer
7	Chapter B Agreement	Sections 5 and 6 Agreement - Sections 6.3, 6.4, 6.11	<p>A. Please confirm that discussions and presentations with the participation of the international consultant will be held in English.</p> <p>B. Please confirm that it will be possible to submit interim reports of the international consultant in English.</p> <p>What is the required language of the final product?</p>	<p>1) Discussions with the participation of the international consultant will be held in English. Presentations that will be presented in English will also be translated into Hebrew.</p> <p>2) Interim reports and the final report will be translated into Hebrew.</p>
8	Chapter B Agreement	Section 5.1.2.2 Agreement – Section 21	<p>A. Please confirm that the Ministry will make the relevant materials and data available to the winner (which are not available on the Internet) in accordance with the methodology that will be approved as part of stage one.</p> <p>Please confirm that delays caused in the execution of the work as a result of access to the information in the possession of the client will not be taken into account for the purpose of examining the winner's compliance with the required schedules.</p>	It shall be clarified that it is the Ministry's responsibility to allow the winner access to the various documents and the material required to perform the work. It is the winner's responsibility to translate the documents for the purpose of performing the work. The materials will be forwarded to the winner in a period of time that will not constitute a delay in the schedule detailed in the Tender documents.
9	Chapter B	Section 6.6	<p>A. Please indicate whether physical presence of the international consultant in Israel is required for certain meetings that are known in advance.</p> <p>B. If so - please indicate the number of meetings.</p>	See answer to question No. 5 in response to clarification questions from 22.09.22.
10	Chapter D	Section 11.1.2	The requirement is not clear. Which documents exactly from the international consultant are required to be approved by way of an apostille ?	There is no change in the Tender documents.

No.	Chapter / Appendix	Section	Question	Approved answer
11	Chapter D Chapter A	Sections 4.1.2, 11.1.2	In light of the schedules and the holiday period in Israel, please confirm to submit during the submission of the bids the documents of the international consultant through copies of certificates and documents approved by an attorney only and the completion of the apostille procedure must be done as a condition for signing the agreement with the winner.	There is no change in the Tender documents.
12	Agreement, Chapter D, Chapter E	Agreement – Sections 6.2, 12.17, 20.1	In light of the lack of confirmation regarding the date of signing the agreement in this type of procedure, please allow more significant preparation time than the date of signing the agreement and put the commitment to the commencement of work at 30 days, which allow a reasonable organization time for the start of action of a complex and international team.	There is no change in the Tender documents.

Sincerely,

Shirley Shmuel

Tenders Committee Coordinator